FINAL MINUTES APPLICATION REVIEW COMMITTEE MEETING Wednesday, September 18, 2013 2:00 P.M.

Call to Order and Roll Call

Meeting called to order by James Heaslet, Application Review Committee Chair at 2:05 P.M.

Committee members present at roll call:

Mike Petrus Mark Keller James Heaslet

Staff Attendance:

Jeanne Galvin – Assistant Attorney General Debra Rudd -- Executive Director Jessica Sapio - Staff

Item II.C. Application AR12009 Dawn R. Tomlinson

The applicant and her Supervisor, Paul Johnson appeared before the committee to respond to their questions regarding the reports submitted for experience review. James Heaslet stated that the committee had not seen support for some of the adjustments in the work file for items such as site adjustments; garage space differences on the property were higher than the livable area adjustments. Both Ms. Tomlinson and Mr. Johnson responded to the questions. Mike Petrus questioned the same neighborhood description for the appraisal on the property located in Estancia (a gated community in north Scottsdale near Pinnacle Peak) as the one submitted on 120th Street and East Shea Blvd. Mike Petrus pointed out that they were looking for the support for the adjustments or lack of adjustments and the fact that these three appraisals had a similar neighborhood description did not lead to credible reports. He then made a motion to recommend denial of the application to the full board due to the lack of competency shown in the reports. James Heaslet seconded the motion. The committee unanimously voted in support of the recommendation to the full board to deny the application from licensed appraiser to certified appraiser for this applicant. Discussion continued about the applicant's options to reapply, if the Board accepted the committee's recommendation.

Item VI - AMC Renewal application for Valuation Partners #40023

Kathy Muneio appeared telephonically to answer any questions that the committee had about the application submitted for renewal. Questions by the committee included the late payments noted for two appraisals in Arizona, and three other late payment complaints in two other states. Ms. Muneio stated that they were researched and proven to have been paid. Mike Petrus made a motion to recommend approval of the application to the full Board. Mark Keller seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

Item IV. A. - Application AR12044 for Michael L. Nelson

Michael Nelson appeared before the committee to answer any questions they may have. He stated that he had been licensed in Arizona since 2007 and wanted to obtain a Certified Residential credential. The committee discussed the appraisals submitted and stated they found no significant issues with any of the reports. Mark Keller made a motion to recommend approval of this application to the full Board. Mike Petrus seconded the motion. The motion was unanimously approved.

THE

Item V. B. - Application for Nonresident Temporary License/Certification for TP41449 – Arthur O. Neudek

After discussing the item found on the background report for this applicant and noting that the credential had already been issued, Mike Petrus questioned if they could send this information to the home state of the appraiser for them to deal with the lack of disclosure in our state. Jeanne Galvin reported a couple of options available to the committee. Mike Petrus motioned

to recommend that a complaint be opened in Arizona for failure to comply with A.R.S. § 32-3631 (A 1) and (A 5) regarding disclosure of the items found in the background check. Mark Keller seconded the motion. All voted in favor of the motion.

Item II E. Request by Michael Woodhead Certified Residential Appraiser #21085 to take the 7-hour National USPAP 2014-2015 class online

The committee discussed the request and the history of this type of request. Mike Petrus made a motion to recommend to the full board to approve the request pending receipt of medical documentation to support the appraiser's allegations of his inability to sit for this class. Mark Keller seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

Item II. D. Discussion regarding the committee's acceptance of appraisal experience gained by Trainees on properties in other states and if they would be allowed to be used Arizona

After discussions on the topic from both the current criteria and the new AQB 2015 criteria, the consensus of the committee was to refer this matter to the full Board for discussion.

Item II. F. Discussion of the revisions to the applications for reciprocity and temporary license/certification

Discussion about the background of reciprocity and the newly enacted A.R.S. § 32-3618, the committee recommended to the full Board to approve the proposed revisions to the applications, subject to the editing of a couple of the sentences in the introduction section.

The committee went off the record to review the rest of the files. When they returned, James Heaslet recommended approval of the remainder of the agenda that had not been previously discussed. Mark Keller seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

The meeting adjourned at 3:40 P.M.